Integrating Refugees and IDPs into National Education Systems
Three Challenges and Approaches
Noah Yarrow

September 29, 2022
Integrating IDPs and Refugees in FCV and non-FCV contexts

Three Main Challenges

- Scale
- Capacity
- Data

National Education System

IDPs
Refugees
Challenges
All the right moves in all the wrong places?

Much current research runs parallel to national education systems rather than through them

1. Psychosocial intervention, Bosnia-Herzegovina
2. Can’t Wait to Learn, Sudan
3. Feed the Monster, Syria
4. Education Reintegration Package, Nepal
5. Classroom based intervention, Nepal
6. Antura and the Letters, Syria
7. MindUp Programme, Uganda
8. Teaching Recovery Techniques, Palestine
9. E-Learning Sudan
10. Creating Opportunities through Mentoring, Parental Involvement and Safe Spaces, Ethiopia
11. Pathways into Reconciliation, Israel & Palestine
12. Kepler, Rwanda
13. Gender Socialization in Schools, Uganda
14. Learning to Read in a Healing Classroom, DRC
15. Child Friendly Spaces, Uganda
16. No Lost Generation, Lebanon
17. WUSC’s remedial education program, Kenya
18. Emergency Food Assistance during Conflict, Mali
19. Early Childhood Development (ECD) Kit, Senegal
20. Introducing New Vocational Education and Skills Training, Afghanistan
21. COGES School Committees, Niger
22. Community-Based Education, Afghanistan
23. Typhoon Aid and Development, Philippines

*6 additional studies had intervention sizes that were unclear and were excluded from this list
Governments may not be able to effectively take over activities without increasing their implementation capacity.

High capacity is not enough – commitment, and financing also matter!

Impact of in-school Computer Assisted Learning on English scores of non-refugee grade 4 students in rural China with different implementation agencies

Source: World Bank Staff Calculations from Mo et al., 2020
**Question:**
What is the per-student cost of education a refugee student vs. a host country student in Pakistan, Colombia, Chad, Jordan?

**Answer:**
We have estimates, but we don’t actually know.

---

**Average annual unit cost for host and refugee students**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average annual unit cost for local students (2020 US$)</th>
<th>Average annual unit costs for refugee students (2020 US$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-primary</td>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower-middle income</td>
<td>535</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper-middle income</td>
<td>2,095</td>
<td>1,612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low and middle</td>
<td>1,002</td>
<td>771</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: World Bank & UNHCR 2021*
How much is being spent on education and how much are kids learning?

If we don’t know this with confidence, what do we know?

Learning Poverty Data estimates
Share of Children at End-of-Primary age below minimum reading proficiency (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>2015-2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>51.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>62.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad</td>
<td>94.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Approaches
Student Learning and Financing Data

Rapid Tests to differentiate host and displaced student populations

Per-student financing data is messy and undifferentiated; need to try new strategies to unpack it
Effect Sizes

Design pilot programs for scale and replicability

Think big, even when starting small

- Need to build management infrastructure and business systems required for scaling implementation
- Need long-term funding commitments
- Need government engagement and champions
- Adaptive, context-specific implementation

Brookings has identified 14 elements needed for scale under the Design, Delivery, Finance and Enabling Environment categories (2016)
Capacity can be defined and measured in different ways at different levels

• **Inputs provided on time** (teacher salary, student textbooks, teacher effort in classroom)
• **Outputs measured** (learning assessments both at the classroom level and summative/national)
• **Information feedback** loops (do regional leaders know teachers absent, textbooks delivered, students not learning?)
• **Mutual accountability** – if inputs and/or outputs lagging, do system members take action? Do they know what to do? Can they do what is needed?

**WB Global Education Policy Dashboard 2020**

• Does your organization have a clear set of performance indicators and targets that are aligned with and contribute to achieving learning goals at the national level?
• Do you think your organization's targets are measurable? To what extent are your daily tasks derived from, and consistent with, your organization's targets?
• Does your organization track how well districts are performing towards achieving these targets overall?
• Do you regularly have access to a functioning (electronic or equivalent) integrated Management Information System (MIS) or other data system?
Conclusion
**Challenge**

- Evaluations of small programs have limited relevance for large scale implementation
- Governments need capacity and commitment to effectively take over programs
- Lack data on spending and learning for refugee, IDP and host populations

**Possible Approach**

- Design pilot programs for scale and replicability AND evaluate more interventions at scale
- Develop and adapt capacity measurement tools and strategies to improve capacity in FCV contexts
- Assess student learning and record disaggregated per-student financing data
Thank you!
nyarrow@worldbank.org
Capacity can be defined and measured in different ways at different levels

- We already know that capacity is low (and dispersion across many metrics is high) in most of our country contexts.
- What can we do about it? What specific strategies and tools do we have for improving education system capacity?