Small States - Performance in Public Debt Management

Jeffrey D. Lewis
Director
Economic Policy, Debt and Trade Department
World Bank

Small States Forum
October 12, 2013, Washington DC
Outline

1. The small state context
2. Assessing public debt management with the DeMPA
3. Key findings
4. Recommendations
Small States Face Special Difficulties

High public debt levels AND slow growth

GDP Growth and Volatility
(Based on real GDP growth rates (PPP) 1971-2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Average Growth</th>
<th>Average Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECCU</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: WEO, IMF Staff Calculations and World Bank Staff Calculations

*1980-2010

1/share of years (%) with growth lower than -5.1 percent (which corresponds to the 5th percentile of all country/years growth)
High Vulnerability to External Shocks and Fiscal Deficits

- Greater frequency / magnitude of natural disasters
- High debt service burden diverts public resources away from critical social and productive capital expenditures
- High debt levels increase cost of new borrowing through augmented perceived market risk of newly issued debt
- Limited fiscal space for counter-cyclical spending can exacerbate crises
- Limited financial capacity to respond to and recover from natural disasters
- Constrained ability to borrow limits government ability to leverage private investment through public private partnerships
Debt & Fiscal Management Links

Debt Management

- **DeMPA** (Process and functions)
- **Reform plans** (from diagnosis to action)
- **Medium-term debt management strategy (MTDS)** (composition of borrowing; linked with sustainability)
- **Debt sustainability (DSA)** (level of debt; fiscal policy)
What is DeMPA

**Objective**
- Assess public debt management performance capacity
- Monitor performance
- Design reform program

**Methodology coverage**
- 15 Performance Indicators (DPI)
- 35 Dimensions
- Covers six core debt management functions
- Central government debt management

**Implementation**
- Assessment missions
- Performance Report – diagnostic
- Report released at the authorities’ discretion
- Demand-driven
# Debt Performance Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governance and Strategy Development</td>
<td>DPI-1 Legal Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-2 Managerial Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-3 Debt Management Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-4 Evaluation of Debt Management Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-5 Audit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination with Macroeconomic Policies</td>
<td>DPI-6 Coordination with Fiscal Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-7 Coordination with Monetary Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrowing and Related Financing Activities</td>
<td>DPI-8 Domestic Borrowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-9 External Borrowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-10 Loan Guarantees, On-lending and Derivatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash Flow Forecasting and Cash Balance Management</td>
<td>DPI-11 Cash Flow Forecasting and Cash Balance Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational Risk Management</td>
<td>DPI-12 Debt Administration and Data Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-13 Segregation of Duties, Staff Capacity and Business Continuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Records and Reporting</td>
<td>DPI-14 Debt Records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPI-15 Debt Reporting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[PREM: Poverty Reduction and Economic Management]
[THE WORLD BANK]
Scoring methodology

Scoring method - Quantifiable scores (A to D)

i) Meet minimum requirement = Score C
   ✓ Important for effective debt management

ii) Absence of minimum requirement = Score D
    ✓ Signals an area of priority attention

iii) Sound practice = Score A (B intermediate score)

iv) Not rated – if process/system does not exist (e.g., derivatives)
DeMPAs in over 70 developing countries

**FY07 – pilot (5)**
- The Gambia
- Malawi
- Albania
- Guyana
- Nicaragua

**FY08 (13)**
- Burkina Faso (RO)
- CAR (RO)
- Ghana
- Mali (RO)
- Mozambique
- Togo
- Sao Tome Principe
- Swaziland (RO)
- Zambia
- Bangladesh
- Honduras (RO)
- Moldova
- Mongolia

**FY09 (14)**
- Burundi (RO)
- Uganda (RO)
- St Kitts & Nevis (ECCB)
- Solomon Islands (RO)
- Cape Verde
- Cameroon (RO)
- Congo, Brazzaville (RO)
- Guinea (RO)
- Nigeria (RO)
- Rwanda (RO)
- Congo, DRC (RO)
- Cote d’Ivoire (RO)
- Grenada
- Antigua

**FY10 (15)**
- Benin
- Mauritania
- Tanzania
- Djibouti
- Pakistan
- Nepal (RO)
- Samoa (RO)
- The Gambia, second (RO)
- Cambodia (RO)
- Maldives (RO)
- Malawi (second)
- Liberia (RO)
- Guinea-Bissau (RO)
- Senegal (RO)
- Sierra Leone (RO)

**FY11 (18)**
- Papua New Guinea
- Albania, second
- Yemen (RO)
- Nicaragua, second (RO)
- Togo, second (RO)
- Kazakhstan
- Mongolia, second (RO)
- Bhutan (RO)
- Comoros (RO)
- Zambia second (RO)
- Lagos
- Burkina Faso, second (RO)
- Swaziland
- Rio de Janeiro
- Tajikistan (RO)
- Belarus
- Afghanistan (RO)
- Sao, Tome & Principe second (RO)

**FY12 – (2)**
- Central African Republic
- Zimbabwe
- Vietnam
- Mali
- Kosovo
- Kenya
- Equatorial Guinea

POVERTY REDUCTION AND ECONOMIC MANAGEMENT
THE WORLD BANK
DeMPA in small states: basic statistics

DeMPA - total sample:
Over 70 countries (as of end-August 2013)

DeMPA - small state sample:
17 (out of the 35 comparable small states)

Small states regional distribution:
Africa - 7; Caribbean - 4; Asia-4

Income: 3 LICs; 12 MICs*

* FY 12
Capacity Constraints

Operational Issues
- Key person risk
- Segregation of duties
- Debt data reporting
- Lack of continuous verification with creditors

Analytical Aspects
- Debt Strategy
- Debt sustainability analysis (DSA)
- Credit risk assessment
- Aggregation of total debt data

Other
- Internal audits
- Performance audits
- Few lawyers with financial skills

Staff Shortages and lack of specialized skills
From diagnosis to reform: the Samoa Reform Plan example

• Samoa exemplifies small state challenges: small population, limited debt capacity, high dependence on external flows, susceptibility to natural disasters
• Samoa Reform Plan (Oct 2012) helped promote active policy discussion, leading to Cabinet-level discussion on debt position, careful scrutiny of future borrowing
• Reform plan recommendations include:
  – Ensuring minimum staffing for DMO
  – Extensive vulnerabilities imply premium on basic analytical work, including more regular review/update of MTDS
  – Initiate work on prerequisites for domestic debt market development
  – Identify possible cost savings from cash management improvements
  – Identify and begin to mitigate operational risks
Key findings from DeMPA analysis

1. Small states appear similar to other states with regard to level of indebtedness

2. Lack of capacity is a challenge

3. Small size enables close coordination and information exchange among debt management entities

4. But prevents effective segregation of duties and results in key person risk (one person performing multiplicity of tasks)

5. Regional market arrangements help overcome constraints of size
Improving Debt Management Capacity: Some Recommendations

1. Benefitting from experience of other developing countries
2. Picking the low hanging fruit
3. Pooling resources through regional cooperation
4. Maximizing the gains of information technology
5. Realizing the benefits of staff training
6. Widening financing options, development of domestic debt markets
Thank you!

*Results in this presentation based on:*

*available at:*
http://elibrary.worldbank.org/content/workingpaper/10.1596/1813-9450-6356