



How should business education be structured to deliver maximum impact?

Xavi Cirera

Innovation, Technology and Entrepreneurship

Business education for female entrepreneurs

- Lack of evidence on the impact of specific programs for female growth entrepreneurs.
- Most of the evidence from programs targeting micro-enterprises:
 - Positive impact on management practices (almost unanimously)
 - Mixed at best impact on firm growth, especially for women (McKenzie and Woodruff (2012))
 - Karlan and Valdivia (2011) in Peru – no impact on average on firm growth
 - Gine and Mansuri (2011) – positive impact on male borrowers growth only
 - De Mel et al. (2012) –no impact on firm growth
 - Calderon et al. (2012) in Mexico – positive impact on growth
 - Botha et al. (2012) for South Africa – some positive impact on treated female entrepreneurs

Business education for female entrepreneurs

Large heterogeneity in delivery

Program	Teaching	Teachers	Mentors	Scale
GS 10,000	150 hours	Faculty	Faculty	10,000 trainees Over 40 countries
Empretec Ghana	72 hours	Staff	External consultants and volunteers	52 in high growth program 600 in other programs
Empretec Global	72 hours	Staff	No mentors	Large Scale 27 countries 120,000 trainees
ILO (GOWE) Kenya	40 hours	Staff	External Consultants	711 firms
FastTrac	30 hours	Staff	No mentors	Large Scale 20 countries 350,000 trainees
Technoserve Women Mean Business		Staff	Staff and volunteers	600 firms already trained 400 firms being trained
Technoserve BCP		Staff	Staff and volunteers	30-70 firms per country
Business Edge	16 hours per module	Staff	No mentors	Large Scale 30 countries 170,000 trainees
ECLA (Endeavor)	120 hours	Faculty and entrepreneur	Volunteers	Small Scale 14 countries less than 500 firms
Astia	40 hours	Entrepreneurs	Volunteers	Small Scale 300 firms

Business education for female entrepreneurs

....and also heterogeneity in content

Content	GS India	GS Rwanda	ILO (GOWE)	Business Edge	FastTrac	TechnoServe WMB & BCP	Empretec	Endeavor
Economic Analysis	X	X		X	X			
Innovation								X
Business Ideas			X		X		X	
New product creation			X					
Business Plan/ Strategy	X	X	X	X	X		X	X
Business Management	X	X	X	X	X			
Financial Planning	X	X	X	X	X	X		
Accounting	X	X	X	X	X	X		
Marketing Analysis	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
Market Strategy	X	X	X	X	X	X		X
HR management	X	X	X	X	X	X		
Leadership	X	X		X	X			
Customer Service	X	X		X		X		
Negotiation		X		X	X		X	
Networking	X	X	X		X		X	X
Exports		X						X
Process Improvement			X	X				X
Access to capital/Loans		X		X	X			X
Gender specific challenges	X		X					
Country specific challenges		X						
Managing a Family Business			X					
Balancing family and business	X							
Self Confidence			X				X	

Business education for female entrepreneurs

- So something does not seem to be working when using business education for supporting growth in female enterprises
- Paradox- positive impact of business education on management quality of these entrepreneurs but no significant impact on business growth
...but a lot of evidence that management quality is an important factor for business growth in medium and large companies

Business education for female entrepreneurs

- Some questions:
 - Are business education programs badly designed? Is there a problem with the content? ..but there is quite a lot of heterogeneity.
 - Do we need a paradigm shift and train to “think” like an entrepreneur?
 - Is the problem how these problems are delivered? Since they may not recognize specific constraints for female enterprises (sector barriers, social norms,..)
 - Is the problem sector sorting that is too much of a binding constraint for female entrepreneurs growth?