Women’s Voice, Agency and Participation

September 24, 2013
Clinton Global Initiative Initiative
New York

Jeni Klugman
Director, Gender and Development
World Bank
Outline

- Where do we stand?
- Evidence, constraints & opportunities
- Moving the agenda forward
- Timeline
Where do we stand?
Progress over the past 30 years

- Gender gaps in primary schools have closed in many countries, globally more women are at university than men
- Women are living longer than men
- Over half a billion women joined the work force

These matter intrinsically.

Evidence also shows that closing gender gaps speeds up social and economic development.

Persistent inequalities, including

- No region is on track to meet MDG5, to cut maternal mortality by 3/4
- Nearly 4 million missing women, annually
- 1.2 billion women worldwide have experienced IPV or non-partner sexual violence
- 15 million 10-14 year old girls married over the last decade
- Less than 25% of parliamentarians in all regions are female and share is expanding very slowly.
Why voice and agency?

- **Key dimensions of gender equality** alongside endowments and opportunities
  - Progress in women’s voice & agency is lagging
  - Deep-seated structural and institutional disparities and norms
  - Significant knowledge gaps

- **Intrinsic value**
  - Ability to make effective choices and exercise control over one’s life is a consistent dimension of well-being

- **Instrumental value**
  - Wellbeing of women and their families, communities and countries
1. Deepen WDR2012 evidence base
   • National and cross-country analyses of unexploited data
   • Extracting lessons from systematic evaluations
   • Selected case studies

2. Deliver policy relevant conclusions
   • Key lessons about what works, what does not, and promising directions

3. Inform WBG and partners’ operations and modalities
   • Explore options to better integrate into Bank analysis, dialogue, operations and monitoring
   • Identify how WBG can support other development partners in areas of strategic advantage
Emerging storyline for the report

Ch 1: Where do we stand?
- Regressive gender based norms are widespread, but can change over time
- Attitudes matter, and affect outcomes – variation within and between countries indicate scope for progressive public and collective action

Ch 2: Expansion of agency: Evidence, constraints and opportunities
- Highlight most recent evidence, e.g.
  - 30% women experienced partner violence in 30 countries

Ch 3: Taking the agenda forward: Cross-cutting issues & recommendations
- Addressing structural issues: norms, laws, collective action and social accountability
- Tackling persistent gaps, eg. Engaging boys and men, GBV, SRH, enhancing voice and agency

Ch 4: Implications for the WBG
- New ways to integrate agency into diagnostics, policies, programmes, future directions and partnerships, with a focus on indicators and monitoring
Background papers commissioned and largely completed

16 thematic papers

- **New empirics**: macro patterns and overlapping inequalities (Samman)
- **Reproductive health**: maternal mortality (Klugman & Grepin)
- **Politics and collective action**: national political participation (NDI); collective action (Evans & Nambiar); collective action MENA (Raza)
- **Land**: urban (Rakodi); rural (Namubiru-Mwaura)
- **Mobility**: Afghanistan mobility survey (WBG)
- **Gender-based Violence**: costs and consequences (Duvvury); engaging men and boys (Flemming & Barker); state of the evidence (WBG & GWU); costs of GBV in Tanzania (Vyas)
- **Laws and legal institutions**: property law country case studies (Trustlaw Connect); laws and institutional norms (Wilson Center)

Five country specific, one regional

- **Chad** (new empowerment data); **India** (Participation and GBV); **Niger** (norms and household dynamics); **Thailand** (educational reform); **Peru** (agency); + regional **Latin America** study (one-stop shops, GBV)
Unpacking agency – theoretical framework

What are the constraints on exercising agency – transforming goods, services and markets into ability to make choices to achieve desired outcomes?

**Individual/internal:** aspirations, self-drive

**Contextual:** social norms, culture

**Empowerment:** capacity to make others (markets, institutions) act in individual’s interest
Agency

- The ability to make choices that are valuable (based on Sen’s capability approach)

Conceptual framework
Focus on ‘expressions’ of agency...

- Freedom from the risk of violence (GBV)
- Control over land and property
- Freedom of movement for work and migration
- Decision making over family formation
- Voice and choice (politics, collective action and household influence)
New empirical work

1. Male and female perceptions of gender equality and links to outcomes
   – World Values Survey for 95+ countries, Gallup World Poll for 130+ countries

2. ‘Overlapping disadvantage’ and agency-related deprivations
   – Demographic Health Survey data for 50+ countries

3. Inequality and outcomes among boys and girls
   – Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys and Young Lives for 20+ countries
Many women experience overlapping deprivations in agency.

Source: Demographic Health Survey
But good news is that norms can change over time

Improved attitudes toward women’s right to a job

Improved attitudes toward university for girls than women as political leaders
Evidence, constraints and opportunities
A major development issue, as well as breach of rights – major costs to individuals and economies
  – New estimates of costs and guidance on methodology

Norms and attitudes are powerful influences
  – Case studies, including connections between political mobilization and programmatic responses to GBV in India

Strong laws are necessary but not sufficient
  – Evaluating international conventions, national laws, and implementation challenges

Reviewing evidence of what works
  – Promising approaches tend to be multi-sectoral, and longer in duration

Interventions need to engage men and boys early
  – Analytical work to understand roles of men and boys as perpetrators, victims, and change agents

Partners
- UN Women; ODI (case studies on GBV); GWU Global Women’s Institute; Oxfam India; Promundo; ICRW; National University of Ireland (and expanding!)
GBV imposes significant costs on families & economies: New evidence from Tanzania:

- Cost of partner violence in terms of productivity loss is roughly 1.4% of GDP.
- Women who are severely physically or sexually abused by a partner earn between $11.55 and $13.50 less weekly than never abused women with similar characteristics – equivalent to roughly 90% of average women’s weekly income.

Some countries struggle with hostile attitudes that endorse GBV:

- In DRC, India and Rwanda, majority of men think women should tolerate violence to keep family together.
- More than 80% men in the DRC and India think VAW laws are too harsh.
- YET, the data also provide hopeful indications that younger men are less likely to perpetrate violence against a partner.

Systematic review of evidence on the effects of GBV prevention interventions finds most evidence coming from wealthy nations:

- More than 80% of the evidence on what works and what doesn't to prevent GBV comes from developed countries (that comprise 6% of the world's population).
- Broad findings show encouraging results for interventions that:
  - Include multiple components, including addressing gender norms
  - Last longer (over 6 months)
Control over land and property

Approach
1. Background papers on land – rural and urban – including review of interventions
2. Empirical analysis on patterns of ownership and linkages to other wellbeing outcomes

Emerging findings

Rural areas:
- Women’s ownership of land can be transformative: as a store of value & means of acquiring other assets and engaging in markets.
- Paucity of data constrains policy-making. While some interventions seem promising, not enough information is available to confirm their effectiveness in addressing women’s land rights.
- Statutory interventions have been largely ineffective at equalizing women’s and men’s land rights in rural areas where customary land traditions prevail.

Urban areas:
- Legal tenure is not a panacea: gender responsive urban development policies and interventions are as important as individual property rights.
- Limited understanding of effectiveness of urban tenure reforms: but multi-sectoral approaches tend to be most effective:
  - Legal & policy changes accompanied by microfinance, entrepreneurial support, service improvements etc.
Family Formation

Proposed value added

- Consideration of agency in context of family formation in relation to health outcomes and other expressions of agency
- Identify promising interventions with implications for Bank operations
- Identify appropriate indicators for operational use

Approach

1. Background papers:
   - Closing the gap between knowledge & action
   - Review of family planning programs & women’s agency

2. Case studies in Niger and Chad

3. Empirical analysis of indicators and outcomes using DHS
Major gaps in women’s agency in sex, reproduction and family formation

On average in 31 countries, over 1/3 of women (36%) report that they are unable to ask their partner to use a condom and over 1/4 (28%), that they cannot refuse sex.

Source: DHS
Voice and choice

Proposed value added

- Advance knowledge of benefits of increasing women’s voice – for themselves, their families and communities
- Review implications for Bank operations
- Identify appropriate indicators for operational use

Approach

1. Background papers:
   - National and local level participation of women
   - Collective action
2. Links to social accountability and Community Driven Development
3. Case study: India, link between women’s political participation and GBV
4. Policy implications for the WBG, including:
   - Resourcing, training and monitoring state and other institutions responsible for implementing reforms

Partners – WBG Social Development Network; NDI; ODI
Moving the agenda forward
**Laws and legal institutions**

**Critical role in expanding agency:**
Citizenship; family law; property regimes; inheritance; gender based violence prevention and victim support; reproductive health; affirmative action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Progress on many fronts</th>
<th>Sticky areas persist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Since 1960, 50% of the discriminatory laws have been removed across 100 countries</td>
<td>90% of countries still have at least 1 discriminatory law on the books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149 countries call for equal protection under the law</td>
<td>Complex web of overlapping customary, religious &amp; statutory systems further exacerbate existing discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>125 countries have criminalized domestic violence</td>
<td>Weak implementation &amp; enforcement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Identifying promising tools and policy approaches,** three areas of focus, grounded in human rights approach:

1. Constitutional and legal reform (eg Kenya, Vietnam and Turkey)
2. Addressing the interaction of customary and religious legal systems with formal legal systems (eg Botswana, South Africa and PNG)
3. Implementation and enforcement (eg India and Indonesia)
Need for better indicators and monitoring

- Paucity of gender-relevant data on agency (e.g., on decision-making, intra-household allocation of resources, GBV surveillance, local participation)

Build on recent progress:
- UN Inter-agency and Expert Group identified 52 core gender indicators, several relating to voice
- UN guidance on collecting statistics on GBV

The report will:
- Take stock of data sources on agency, ongoing efforts and key gaps
- Recommend typology of indicators on voice and agency and associated determinants for country monitoring and Bank operations
Expected timeline and selected milestones

**PAST EVENTS**

- **2012**
  - Dec: Advisory Council Meeting, Stockholm
  - Jan: Conference on Gender and Land, Utrecht
  - Feb: UN CSW Consultation and GBV costing side events
  - Mar: 1st meeting of Technical Advisory Group
  - Apr: WBG Annual Land Conference Consultation
  - May: DFID & OECD Adolescent girls and social norms
  - Jun: South Asia region-wide event on violence, Nepal

- **2013**
  - Jul: HDCA Nicaragua Consultation
  - Aug: 2nd meeting of Technical Advisory Group

**FUTURE EVENTS**

- **2013**
  - Sept: UNDP HDRO Consultation
  - Oct: Annual Meetings
  - Nov: Australia National University
  - Dec: First full report DRAFT
  - 2014
  - Jan: Second full report DRAFT
  - Feb: Conference on rights of women in Africa (South Africa)
  - Mar: Third DRAFT – Bank-wide review
  - Apr: REPORT LAUNCH

Report consultations are in GREEN
FIND OUT MORE AT:
www.worldbank.org/gender/agency