Romania: The Management Information System (MIS) of the Social Assistance System: Past, Present and Future

Lacramiora Corches  General Director – Social Assistance Department
                      Ministry of Labor & Social Protection, Romanian

Sabin Chiricescu  Local IT Consultant
                      World Bank
1. Context
2. Development of the MIS
3. Features of the MIS: strengths & limitations
4. Plan to expand the MIS
Context – Romania’s Social Assistance system

- Romania’s Social Assistance System includes **12 programs** administered by MoLFSP, and others administered by local governments;

- These programs fall into 4 categories:
  - family policy programs;
  - programs for people with disabilities;
  - other programs (notably the social pension);
  - means-tested programs for low-income households;
SAFIR today (2014) - Main facts

- The MIS is known as SAFIR
- Covers 8 social assistance programs from a total of 12
  - 1.2 Billion Euro from a total of 1.7 Billion Euro
- Processes around 5 million monthly payments
- Administered by 500 internal users
- Large programs managed through SAFIR (beneficiaries/month)
  - State Child Allowance: ~3.800.000 beneficiaries (children)
  - Child Raising Allowance: ~170.000 beneficiaries (persons)
  - Family Allowances: ~260.000 beneficiaries (families)
  - Guaranteed Minimum Income: ~170.000 beneficiaries (families)
- Around 6 million persons out of a population of around 20 millions
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Assistance Program</th>
<th>Number of Beneficiaries</th>
<th>Payment LEI (4.45 Lei = 1 Euro)</th>
<th>Payments through SAFIR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 State child allowance</td>
<td>3,793,117</td>
<td>2,718,491,547</td>
<td>2,718,491,547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Child Raising Allowance</td>
<td>141,976</td>
<td>1,619,189,337</td>
<td>1,619,189,337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Child Raising Back to Work Bonus</td>
<td>30,780</td>
<td>189,548,710</td>
<td>189,548,710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Family allowance</td>
<td>260,416</td>
<td>215,061,950</td>
<td>215,061,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Maintenance allowance for the child in placement</td>
<td>40,352</td>
<td>51,833,331</td>
<td>51,833,331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Guaranteed minimum income</td>
<td>171,568</td>
<td>567,213,269</td>
<td>567,213,269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Financial and urgent aid (one time)</td>
<td>734</td>
<td>4,317,920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Refugee benefit</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>795,960</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Heating benefit</td>
<td>1,021,376</td>
<td>368,459,714</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Child with disability raising support</td>
<td>7,873</td>
<td>34,900,103</td>
<td>34,900,103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Monthly food indemnity for persons with HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>8,284</td>
<td>38,827,386</td>
<td>38,827,386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Disability benefits (more programs)</td>
<td>671,143</td>
<td>2,074,150,926</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL LEI</strong></td>
<td><strong>7,882,790,153</strong></td>
<td><strong>5,435,065,633</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL EURO</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,771,413,518</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,221,363,064</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% through SAFIR</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Development of SAFIR

- **2007 – 2008:** Development (SAFIR, version1)
- **2009:** Pilot (2 counties)
- **2009:** Country-wide rollout
- **2010-2014:** Improvements of SAFIR mainly due to reforms to existing programs (Guaranteed Minimum Income, Family Support Allowance)
- **2013-2014:** cross-checking beneficiaries’ data from SAFIR with information from other institutions (Civil Registry, tax authority, pension data, unemployment benefit)
  - First bulk data cross-check
  - 11 million beneficiaries’ records checked
  - Data mismatches ➔ suspicious files ➔ ranked by risk level ➔ high risks suspicions were inspected and corrected
## MAIN COSTS of SAFIR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SAFIR SOFTWARE</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-2009</td>
<td>2.7 MEuro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>1.8 MEuro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-2014</td>
<td>0.7 MEuro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL SOFTWARE</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.2 MEURO</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>HARDWARE (SERVERS)</th>
<th>DATABASE (ORACLE)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007-2009</td>
<td>1.9 MEuro</td>
<td>0.9 MEuro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>1.0 Meuro</td>
<td>0.6 Meuro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL HW+DB</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.4 MEURO</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL SAFIR (SW+HW+DB)** | **9.6 MEURO**
SAFIR: Current Version, Document flow

- **Beneficiary 1**: Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents → CITY HALL locality XXX, Social Assistance Department → List of sent documents, Documents of many beneficiaries → NASB
  - **Local NASB county C1**: Input the request and the eligibility documents, Issue the "social benefit decision" → Approve payments → CENTRAL NASB
    - **Central NASB**: PAYMENT PROCESS: verifies centralized payment roster; prints payment orders for Post Office; issues payment orders; produces monitoring reports for the Ministry of Labor, Family, and Social Protection → PAYMENT CHANNELS (POST, BANKS) → Beneficiary 1, Beneficiary 2, Beneficiary n
- **Beneficiary 2**: Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents → CITY HALL locality YYY, Social Assistance Department → MANUAL PROCESS ASKING/SENDING MISSING DOCUMENTS → Beneficiary 2
- **Beneficiary n**: Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents → CITY HALL locality XXX, Social Assistance Department → Beneficiary n
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major component</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Arhitecture           | CENTRALIZED three tiers architecture  
client tier: Web browser,  
middle tier: Java EE application servers  
the backend tier: Oracle Database Server |
| Interface             | WEB                                                                                                                                          |
| Operating System      | LINUX RED HAT                                                                   |
| Application server    | JBOSS Application                                                               |
| Database Engine       | ORACLE RAC (current version is 10g)                                               |
| Software Development  | JAVA EE framework as development standards, GWT – Google Web Toolkit framework for the creation of graphic interfaces |
| Production environment. Development environment. The backup of the system is assured through a Disaster Recovery Center |
SAFIR: Current Version
Business Systems

SAFIR includes two business systems:

- **Operational system** – management of the beneficiary data and payments for the social benefits
  - Data input modules
  - Data view module
  - Benefits rules management module
  - Payment module
  - Administration module

- **Decision system** -- business intelligence reporting and analysis
  - Support system for decision making at central and county level
  - Collects information from other government bodies
  - Bulk data cross-check to identify suspicions
SAFIR: Current Version
Strenghts

- Centralized payment system for the largest social assistance programs
- Centralized system and web base architecture
- Registry of beneficiaries with unique beneficiary file, including all receipts of social assistance
- Eligibility calculator; routine verification of eligibility status when the circumstances of the beneficiary have changed
- Monitoring the stock and flow of beneficiaries
- Easy data integration with other public databases using an unique ID: Personal Numeric Code (cross checking for detecting and reducing EFC)
SAFIR: Current Version

Limitations

- Does not cover all social assistance programs (e.g. heating and disability benefits)
- Lacks open access from other organizations (e.g. City Halls)
- Not integrated with the accounting system
- Some modules still under-developed:
  - Business Intelligence
  - Monitoring & Evaluation
  - Error and Fraud control
  - Social Inspection planning & monitoring
Road ahead:
Plans to expand the functionalities of the MIS

- Increase coverage of the MIS to new programs:
  - Minimum Social Insertion Program (MSIP), that consolidate all means-tested programs into a flagship anti-poverty program
  - Disability allowance programs

- New data entry modules:
  - direct data entry of eligibility and recertification at city hall level
  - data input using recognition software

- New and dedicated business module for the Social Inspection (planning inspections; recording results; analytics)

- Improved integration with Financial/Accounting System:

- Improved Decision-Maker Module
Roads ahead:
future SAFIR main flows

**CITY HALL**
- Social Assistance Department
  - Future directly data input for simple benefits (ex. state child allowance)

**new SAFIR**
- **DATA ENTRY**
  - EFC PREVENTION CHECKS
  - ELIGIBILITY CHECK
    - new entrance validation;
  - MONTHLY RECERTIFICATION and PAYMENT MANAGEMENT
    - monthly automated and manualy exits, hold, resume; monthly payment calculation

- **PAYMENT CHANNELS**
  - MF TREASURY

- **DATAWAREHOUSE**
  - DATA MATCHING, RISK PROFILES
  - STATISTICS

- **OTHER GOVERNMENTAL DATA SOURCES**
  - FISCAL HUB, PENSION
  - CIVIL REGISTER, UNEMPLOYMENT

- **SOCIAL INSPECTION**
  - SUB- MODULE
    - planning inspections;
    - recording results;
    - referral system

- MINISTRY OF LABOUR

BENEFICIARIES
Roads ahead: future MIS and Social Inspection flow

- **Social Assistance operational MIS SAFIR**
- **National Registry of Disabled Persons**
- **External Data Civil Registry Fiscal Hub Pension**
- **National Registry of Services Organizations to be developed currently Excel files**
- **People**
- **MoLFSPE Employees**

**SAFIR DATWAREHOUSE**
- DATAMATCHING, RISK PROFILES and STATISTICS (done by IT)

**CONTACT CENTER REFERRAL SYSTEM**
- FIRST QUALIFICATION

**SOCIAL INSPECTION BENEFIT**
- List of suspicions prioritized

**SOCIAL INSPECTION SERVICES**
- Suspcion (individual)
- List of organization to be planned for inspection

**SOCIAL INSPECTION SPECIAL AND COMPLEX INVESTIGATION**
- Benefit suspicion
- Debits Proposal per benefit, dossier
- Debits Proposal per Service, organization

**PAYMENTS DEPARTMENT**
- DEBTS Computation and Recovery
- Information Exchange

**PROPOSALS FOR CHANGES LEGAL FRAMEWORK**

- Feedback for Improving Data matching And Risk profiles
- Other Organizations Prosecution Banks Others
The new version of SAFIR

Expected to have a range of benefits, including:

- More and/or new programs
- Faster processing of applications (data entry at City Halls;)
- Better informed decision-making process;
- Reduced error and fraud using both ways: prevention and bulk post factum checking