Romania: The Management Information System (MIS) of the Social Assistance System: Past, Present and Future

Lacramiora Corches  General Director – Social Assistance Department Ministry of Labor & Social Protection, Romanian

Sabin Chiricescu  Local IT Consultant World Bank
OUTLINE

1. Context
2. Development of the MIS
3. Features of the MIS: strengths & limitations
4. Plan to expand the MIS
Romania’s Social Assistance System includes 12 programs administered by MoLFSP, and others administered by local governments;

These programs fall into 4 categories:

- family policy programs;
- programs for people with disabilities;
- other programs (notably the social pension);
- means-tested programs for low-income households;
SAFIR today (2014) - Main facts

- The MIS is known as SAFIR
- Covers 8 social assistance programs from a total of 12
  - 1.2 Billion Euro from a total of 1.7 Billion Euro
- Processes around 5 million monthly payments
- Administered by 500 internal users
- Large programs managed through SAFIR (beneficiaries/month)
  - State Child Allowance: ~ 3,800,000 beneficiaries (children)
  - Child Raising Allowance: ~ 170,000 beneficiaries (persons)
  - Family Allowances: ~ 260,000 beneficiaries (families)
  - Guaranteed Minimum Income: ~ 170,000 beneficiaries (families)
- Around 6 million persons out of a population of around 20 millions
## SAFIR today (2013) – Detailed figures per program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Assistance Program</th>
<th>Number of Beneficiaries</th>
<th>Payment LEI (4.45 Lei =1 Euro)</th>
<th>(4.45 Payments through SAFIR)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 State child allowance</td>
<td>3,793,117</td>
<td>2,718,491,547</td>
<td>2,718,491,547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Child Raising Allowance</td>
<td>141,976</td>
<td>1,619,189,337</td>
<td>1,619,189,337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Child Raising Back to Work Bonus</td>
<td>30,780</td>
<td>189,548,710</td>
<td>189,548,710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Family allowance</td>
<td>260,416</td>
<td>215,061,950</td>
<td>215,061,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Maintenance allowance for the child in placement</td>
<td>40,352</td>
<td>51,833,331</td>
<td>51,833,331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Guaranteed minimum income</td>
<td>171,568</td>
<td>567,213,269</td>
<td>567,213,269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Financial and urgent aid (one time)</td>
<td>734</td>
<td>4,317,920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Refugee benefit</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>795,960</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Heating benefit</td>
<td>1,021,376</td>
<td>368,459,714</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Child with disability raising suport</td>
<td>7,873</td>
<td>34,900,103</td>
<td>34,900,103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Monthly food indemnity for persons with HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>8,284</td>
<td>38,827,386</td>
<td>38,827,386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Disability benefits (more programs)</td>
<td>671,143</td>
<td>2,074,150,926</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL LEI</strong></td>
<td><strong>7,882,790,153</strong></td>
<td><strong>5,435,065,633</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL EURO</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,771,413,518</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,221,363,064</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% through SAFIR</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>69%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Development of SAFIR

- **2007 – 2008:** Development (SAFIR, version 1)
- **2009:** Pilot (2 counties)
- **2009:** Country-wide rollout
- **2010-2014:** Improvements of SAFIR mainly due to reforms to existing programs (Guaranteed Minimum Income, Family Support Allowance)
- **2013-2014:** Cross-checking beneficiaries’ data from SAFIR with information from other institutions (Civil Registry, tax authority, pension data, unemployment benefit)
  - First bulk data cross-check
  - 11 million beneficiaries’ records checked
  - Data mismatches ➔ suspicious files ➔ ranked by risk level ➔ high risks suspicions were inspected and corrected
# MAIN COSTS of SAFIR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>SAFIR SOFTWARE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-2009</td>
<td>2.7 MEuro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>1.8 MEuro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-2014</td>
<td>0.7 MEuro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL SOFTWARE</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.2 MEURO</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>HARDWARE (SERVERS)</th>
<th>DATABASE (ORACLE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007-2009</td>
<td>1.9 MEuro</td>
<td>0.9 MEuro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>1.0 Meuro</td>
<td>0.6 Meuro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL HW+DB</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.4 MEURO</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL SAFIR (SW+HW+DB)** | **9.6 MEURO**
SAFIR: Current Version, Document flow

- **Beneficiary 1**
  - Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents
  - City Hall locality XXX
    - Social Assistance Department
    - List of sent documents
    - Documents of many beneficiaries
  - NASB
    - Local NASB county C1
      - Input the request and the eligibility documents
      - Issue the "social benefit decision"
      - Approve payments
    - Central NASB
      - Payment process: verifies centralized payment roster; prints payment orders for Post Office; issues payment orders; produces monitoring reports for the Ministry of Labor, Family, and Social Protection
      - Payment channels (Post, Banks)
        - Beneficiary 1
        - Beneficiary 2
        - Beneficiary n

- **Beneficiary 2**
  - Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents
  - City Hall locality YYY
    - Social Assistance Department
    - Manual process asking/sending missing documents
    - Beneficiary 1
    - Beneficiary 2
    - Beneficiary n

- **Beneficiary n**
  - Benefit Request and Eligibility Documents
  - City Hall locality YYY
    - Social Assistance Department
    - Manual process asking/sending missing documents
    - Beneficiary 1
    - Beneficiary 2
    - Beneficiary n
## SAFIR: Current Version
### Technical details 1/2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major component</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Architecture</td>
<td>CENTRALIZED three tiers architecture client tier: Web browser, middle tier: Java EE application servers the backend tier: Oracle Database Server</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interface</td>
<td>WEB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating System</td>
<td>LINUX RED HAT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application server</td>
<td>JBOSS Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Database Engine</td>
<td>ORACLE RAC (current version is 10g)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software Development</td>
<td>JAVA EE framework as development standards, GWT – Google Web Toolkit framework for the creation of graphic interfaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production environment</td>
<td>Production environment. Development environment. The backup of the system is assured through a Disaster Recovery Center</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See next slide for more details
SAFIR: Current Version
Business Systems

SAFIR includes two business systems:

- **Operational system** – management of the beneficiary data and payments for the social benefits
  - Data input modules
  - Data view module
  - Benefits rules management module
  - Payment module
  - Administration module

- **Decision system** -- business intelligence reporting and analysis
  - Support system for decision making at central and county level
  - Collects information from other government bodies
  - Bulk data cross-check to identify suspicions
SAFIR: Current Version
Strengths

- Centralized payment system for the largest social assistance programs
- Centralized system and web base architecture
- Registry of beneficiaries with unique beneficiary file, including all receipts of social assistance
- Eligibility calculator; routine verification of eligibility status when the circumstances of the beneficiary have changed
- Monitoring the stock and flow of beneficiaries
- Easy data integration with other public databases using an unique ID: Personal Numeric Code (cross checking for detecting and reducing EFC)
SAFIR: Current Version
Limitations

- Does not cover all social assistance programs (e.g. heating and disability benefits)
- Lacks open access from other organizations (e.g. City Halls)
- Not integrated with the accounting system
- Some modules still under-developed:
  - Business Intelligence
  - Monitoring & Evaluation
  - Error and Fraud control
  - Social Inspection planning & monitoring
Road ahead:
Plans to expand the functionalities of the MIS

- Increase coverage of the MIS to new programs:
  - Minimum Social Insertion Program (MSIP), that consolidate all means-tested programs into a flagship anti-poverty program
  - Disability allowance programs

- New data entry modules:
  - Direct data entry of eligibility and recertification at city hall level
  - Data input using recognition software

- New and dedicated business module for the Social Inspection (planning inspections; recording results; analytics)

- Improved integration with Financial/Accounting System:
  - Improved Decision-Maker Module
Roads ahead: future SAFIR main flows

**CITY HALL**
- Social Assistance Department
  - City Hall Data Entry Web Interface

**new SAFIR**
- DATA ENTRY
  - EFC PREVENTION CHECKS
- ELIGIBILITY CHECK
  - new entrance validation;
- MONTHLY RECERTIFICATION and PAYMENT MANAGEMENT
  - monthly automated and manualy exits, hold, resume; monthly payment calculation

**OTHER GOVERNMENTAL DATA SOURCES**
- FISCAL HUB, PENSION CIVIL REGISTER, UNEMPLOYMENT

**MINISTRY OF LABOUR**
- DATAWAREHOUSE
  - DATA MATCHING, RISK PROFILES
  - STATISTICS
- REFERENCES
- SOCIAL INSPECTION
  - SUB- MODULE
    - planning inspections;
    - recording results;
    - referral system

**PAYMENT CHANNELS**
- MF TREASURY
  - payment orders
  - payment list
  - payment conclusion

**BENEFICIARIES**
- Future directly data input for simple benefits (ex. state child allowance)
- input data through Internet
- input data

**DATA ENTRY**
- EFC prevention checking
- Data transfer

**RISK PROFILES**
- STATISTICS
- OTHER GOVERNMENTAL DATA SOURCES
- Suspicion lists
- Data (for bulk data matching)
- Referalls

**INSPECTIONS**
- recording results;
- referral system
Roads ahead: future MIS and Social Inspection flow

- Social Assistance operational MIS SAFIR
- National Registry of Disabled Persons
- External Data Civil Registry Fiscal Hub Pension
- National Registry of Services Organizations to be developed currently Excel files
- People
- MoLFSPE Employees

SAFIR DATAWAREHOUSE
DATAMATCHING, RISK PROFILES and STATISTICS (done by IT)

CONTACT CENTER REFERRAL SYSTEM
FIRST QUALIFICATION

SOCIAL INSPECTION BENEFIT

SOCIAL INSPECTION SERVICES

SOCIAL INSPECTION SPECIAL AND COMPLEX INVESTIGATION

PAYMENTS DEPARTMENT
DEBTS Computation and Recovery

PROPOSALS FOR CHANGES LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Feedback for Improving Data matching And Risk profiles

List of suspicions prioritized
Suspicion (individual)
List of organization to be planned for inspection

Debts Proposal per benefit, dossier
Debts Proposal per Service, organization

Information Exchange

Other Organizations Prosecution Banks Others
The new version of SAFIR

Expected to have a range of benefits, including:

- More and/or new programs
- Faster processing of applications (data entry at City Halls;)
- Better informed decision-making process;
- Reduced error and fraud using both ways: prevention and bulk post factum checking